

VOLUME 2, ISSUE 2

APRIL 2005

California Institute of Integral Studies

EWP9566/PARA9566/PARP9566:

ADVANCED Ph.D. SEMINAR: COMPARATIVE MYSTICISM

Fall 2004 (3 units)

Wednesdays 11:45-2:45

Instructor: Jorge N. Ferrer, Ph.D. Tel. (415) 575-6100x416; email: [Jferrer@ciis.edu].

Course Description:

In the spirit of dialogue and inquiry, this advanced seminar provides an in-depth exploration of the field of comparative mysticism. After discussing the various meanings of the term “mysticism,” an overview of the field of comparative mysticism and its methodological foundations will be offered. We will discuss the major horizons of the field, as well as key hermeneutic issues such as orientalism, ethnocentrism, universalism, pluralism, relativism, incommensurability, etc. Then we will study the main families of interpretive models in the field: perennialist, constructivist, feminist, neo-perennialist, evolutionary, contextualist, postmodern, pluralist, and participatory. We will also explore the value that the interreligious dialogue and psychedelic research may have for the study of comparative mysticism. Students will select two mystical traditions, authors, notions, or phenomena and compare them applying one of the models studied or their own comparative approach. Students will be encouraged to approach the study of mystics and mystical texts from an empathic, participatory, and contemplative perspective.

Summary of Educational Purpose:

The main purpose of this course is to deepen students’ knowledge of classic and contemporary approaches to the study of comparative mysticism. An additional objective is to guide students in the selection of the most adequate comparative approach for their research interests.

Learning Objectives:

After completing this course, students will be able to:

1. Appreciate the complexity of the philosophical, epistemological, and psychospiritual issues raised by mystical phenomena.
2. Have a clear understanding of the main models, challenges, and debates in the contemporary study of comparative mysticism.
3. Compare mystical traditions, authors, notions, and phenomena with empathy, rigor, and sophistication.

Learning Activities:

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

1. Cognitive/Didactic (lecture): 40%
2. Practical/Applied (dialogue, presentations): 40%
3. Experiential (meditative inquiry, group process): 20%

Level of Instruction:

Ph.D. level / MA students *only* with consent of the instructor.

Criteria for Evaluation:

1. Mid-term paper (2-6 pages): 20%
2. Final Paper (15-20 pages): 40%
3. Class participation and presentations: 40%

Grading Options:

Letter Grade, Pass/Fail, or as allowed by the department.

Required Texts:

1. Ferrer, J. N. (2002). Revisioning Transpersonal Theory: A Participatory Vision of Human Spirituality. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press. (RTT)
2. Course Reader, available at Copy Central (2336 Market Street, between Castro and Noe. Tel. 415-431-6725)

Recommended Texts:

Students select texts from attached Research Bibliography (see pp. 11-15) according to their own interests.

Assignments:

1. Mid-Term Paper: (2-6 pages)

This assignment can take the form of an outline or preliminary draft (work in progress) of the final paper, or a brief response paper to one of the topics discussed during weeks 1-7.

2. Final Paper: (15-20 pages)

A research paper comparing two or more mystical traditions, authors, notions, or phenomena. Optionally, incorporate aspects of your personal experience in support of your main thesis.

3. Presentations:

Students will give a presentation (or co-presentation) on their comparative research project. Presentations should be linked to final essays.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

Course Schedule and Reading List Comparative Mysticism

INTRODUCTION

September 1. Introduction: Mysticism and You

Introductory overview of the course. Participants' introductions. Etymology and genealogy of the term "mysticism." Preliminary definitions. Guidelines for the practice of dialogical inquiry and contemplative reading of mystical texts.

- Readings:**
- Bouyer, Louis, "Mysticism: An Essay of the History of the Word."
 - King, Richard, "The Power of Definitions: A Genealogy of the Idea of 'the Mystical.'"
 - Happold, F. C., "What We Shall Understand by Mysticism;" "The Mysticism of Love and Union and the Mysticism of Knowledge and Understanding;" "Nature-Mysticism, Soul-Mysticism, and God-Mysticism."
 - Arico, Carl, "The *Lectio Divina* Tradition: Lost and Found."

HISTORICAL AND METHODOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS

September 8. Entering Mysticism

Grounding our research interests in our lived inquiry: What does "mystical" mean *to you*? Why is mysticism important in *your* life? A brief history of mysticism: Mysticism or mysticisms? The classic *unio mystica*. Armchair versus participatory approaches: From students of mysticism to scholar-mystics.

- Readings:**
- Ellwood, Robert S., "A History of Mysticism."
 - Hollenback, Jess Byron, "The Mystical Experience: A Preliminary Reconnaissance."
 - Dupré, Louis, "*Unio Mystica*: The State and the Experience."
 - Barnard, G. William, "Transformations and Transformers: Spirituality and the Academic Study of Mysticism."

September 15. Comparative Mysticism: An Overview

The comparativist approach to the study of religion. Historical overview of the field of comparative mysticism. The psychology-comparativist dialogue. Goals of comparative mysticism.

- Readings:**
- Paden, William E., "Comparative Perspective in the Study of Religion."

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- McGinn, Bernard, “Comparativist and Psychological Approaches to Mysticism.”
- Parsons, William B., “Themes and Debates in the Psychology-Comparativist Dialogue”
- Patton, Kimberley C. and Ray, Benjamin C., “Introduction” to A Magic Still Dwells: Comparative Religion in the Postmodern Age.
- Rao, Srinivasa, “Comparative Metaphysics: Means or end?”

September 22. How to Study Mysticism: Issues in Comparative and Mystical Hermeneutics.

Interpreting spiritual texts. Cross-cultural hermeneutics: orientalism, ethnocentrism, universalism, pluralism, relativism, incommensurability, and others. New methodological approaches in comparative religion and mysticism. The study of mysticism as a mystical hermeneutic path.

- Readings:**
- Sheldrake, Philip, “Interpreting Spiritual Texts.”
 - Staal, Frits, “Effort, Doubt, and Criticism.”
 - Cousins, Ewert H., “Methodology for Mysticism.”
 - Holdrege, Barbara, A., “What’s Beyond the Post? Comparative Analysis as Critical Method.”
 - Neville, Robert C. and Wildman, Wesley, “On Comparing Religious Ideas.”
 - Kripal, Jeffrey J., “Roads of Excess,” “Palaces of Wisdom.”

Case Study: Orientalism and Jung

- Clarke, J. J., “Orientalism;” “Criticisms and Shortcomings.” (In Jung’s approach to Eastern thought)
- Jones, Richard H., “Concerning Carl Jung on Asian Religious Traditions.”

INTERPRETIVE MODELS IN COMPARATIVE MYSTICISM

September 29. Traditionalist/Perennialist Approaches

The perennial philosophy. Traditional perennialist hermeneutics. The transcendent unity of religions. Varieties of perennialism: Basic, Esotericist, Perspectivist, Typological, and Structuralist. Fundamental assumptions of perennialism. Critical perspectives.

- Readings:**
- Borella, Jean, “René Guénon and the Traditionalist School.”
 - Quinn, W. W., “Hermeneutics of the Tradition.”
 - Smith, Huston, “Introduction” to Schuon’s The Transcendent Unity of Religions.
 - Nasr, Seyyed Hossein, “The *Philosophia Perennis* and the Study of Religion.”
 - King, Sallie B., “The *Philosophia Perennis* and the Religions of the World.”
 - Ferrer, Jorge, “Trouble in Paradise: The Perennial Philosophy Revisited.” (RTT: pp. 71-80, 86-95, 110-11).

October 6. Constructivist/Feminist Approaches

The strong constructivist program in the study of mysticism. Epistemological challenges to the idea of a universal mysticism. Mysticism and mediation. Feminism and the study of mysticism. Social constructivism and gender. Critical perspectives.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Readings:**
- Katz, Steven T., “Language, Epistemology, and Mysticism.”
 - Gimello, Robert. M., “Mysticism in Its Contexts.”
 - Raphael, Melissa, “Feminism, Constructivism and Numinous Experience.”
 - Jantzen, Grace M., “Conclusion: Mysticism and Modernity.”
 - Evans, Donald, “Can Philosophers Limit What Mystics Can Do: A Critique of Steven Katz.”

October 13. Neo-Perennialist/Evolutionary Approaches

Neo-perennialist approaches. The search for a cross-cultural “pure consciousness event.” Evolutionary neo-perennialism. Critical perspectives.

- Readings:**
- Forman, Robert, “Introduction: Mystical Consciousness, the Innate Capacity, and the Perennial Psychology.”
 - Fenton, John. Y., “Mystical Experience as a Bridge for Cross-Cultural Philosophy of Religion: A Critique.”
 - Wilber, Ken, “The Spectrum of Consciousness: Integral Psychology and the Perennial Philosophy;” “In a Modern Light: Integral Anthropology and the Evolution of Cultures;” “The Reconstruction of the Contemplative Path.”
 - Ferrer, Jorge, “Wilber’s Neo-Perennialism;” “Transpersonal Developmental Models.” (RTT: pp. 83-86, 95-105, 162-65)

October 20. Postmodern/Contextualist Approaches

Postmodern approaches. Further developments in the contextualist approach to mysticism. Experiential constructivism. Mystical “empowerment.” Critical perspectives.

- Readings:**
- Cupitt, Don, “ Introduction: The Mysticism of Secondariness.”
 - Herman, Jonathan, “The Contextual Illusion: Comparative Mysticism and Postmodernism.”
 - Stoeber, Michael, “Constructivist Epistemologies of Mysticism: A Critique and a Revision.”
 - Hollenback, Jess Byron, “The Contextuality of the Most Elevated States of Spiritual Perfection and Mystical Awareness;” “Conclusion.”

MID-TERM ASSIGNMENT DUE!

October 27. Pluralist/Participatory Approaches

Pluralist approaches to comparative mysticism. The idea of multi-focal points. Soteriological and metaphysical pluralisms. Participatory approaches. On ranking mystical traditions. Critical perspectives.

- Readings:**
- Vroom, Hendrik. M., “Exclusivity and Universality: Interreligious Relations”
 - Heim, S. Mark, “Salvations: A More Pluralistic Hypothesis.”
 - Kaplan, Stephen, “An Overview of the Problem and the Proposal;” “The Issue of Soteriological Exclusivity.”
 - Ferrer, Jorge, “An Ocean with Many Shores: The Challenge of Spiritual Pluralism;” “On Ranking Spiritual Traditions;” “The Problem of Mediation in

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

Spiritual Knowing;" "Spiritual Liberation;" "A More Relaxed Spiritual Universalism." (RTT: 133-149, 151-162, 171-181, 189-191)

INTERFAITH DIALOGUE AND THE PSYCHEDELIC EVIDENCE

November 3. The Interreligious and Intermonastic Dialogue

Relevance of the contemporary interreligious dialogue for comparative mysticism. Religious absolutism. Inclusivism, exclusivism, and ecumenical pluralism. Intermonastic interaction: From dialogue to communion. Inter-spirituality and global mysticism. Students' presentations.

- Readings:**
- Clarke, J. J., "Religious Dialogue."
 - Wiggins, James B., "Whither Inter-Religious Interchange?"
 - Ferrer, Jorge, "The Problem of Conflicting Truth-Claims in Religion;" "The Validity of Spiritual Truths." (RTT: pp. 165-171)
 - Ray, Reginald, "Background: Contemplative Dialogue at Naropa Institute."
 - Teasdale, Wayne, "What is Inter-Spirituality?" Opening the Heart of the World: Toward a Universal Mysticism."

November 10. Comparative Mysticism and the Psychedelic Evidence

Psychedelics and mysticism. Do psychedelics disclose genuine mystical insights? Implications of psychedelic research for the contemporary study of comparative mysticism. Students' presentations.

- Readings:**
- Zaehner, Robert T., "Mysticism Sacred and Profane."
 - Smith, Huston, "Do Drugs Have Religious Import?"
 - Grof, Stanislav, "A Taxonomy of Transpersonal Experiences."
 - Merkur, Daniel, "The Unitive Phenomena."
 - Ferrer, Jorge, "Grof's Neo-Advaitin Perennial Philosophy;" "A Participatory Account of Grof's Consciousness Research." (RTT: pp. 80-83, 149-151)

COMPARING MYSTICS, MYSTICAL PHENOMENA, AND MYSTICAL ULTIMATE REALITIES

November 17. Analysis of Comparative Studies I: Mystics

Collaborative exploration and critical analysis of comparative studies of classic and contemporary mystics. Participants will select from the several samples included in the reader. Students' presentations.

- Readings:**
- Parrinder, Geoffrey, "Theophany: Differences between Krishna and Christ."
 - Suzuki, Daisetz, T., "Crucifixion and Enlightenment."

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Carpenter, David, “Bhartrhari and Bonaventure in Comparison.”
- Chatterji, Pritibhushan, “Plotinus and Sri Aurobindo: A Comparative Study.”
- Wong, Joseph H., “Through Detachment of Vision: Chuang Tzu and Meister Eckhart.”

November 24. Analysis of Comparative Studies II: Mystical Phenomena

Collaborative exploration and critical analysis of comparative studies of mystical phenomena. Participants will select from the several samples included in the reader. Students’ presentations.

- Readings:**
- Loy, David, “Three Approaches to the Subject-Object Relation.” (Sankhya-Yoga, Buddhism, and Advaita Vedanta)
 - Sundarajan, K. R., “Experiencing the World: A Comparative Study of Lila and Satori.”
 - Jennings, William H., “*Agape* and *Karuna*: Some Comparisons.”
 - Elder, George, “Grace in Martin Luther and Tantric Buddhism.”
 - Hacker, Paul, “Cit and Nous, or the Concept of Spirit in Vedantism and Neoplatonism.”

December 1. Analysis of Comparative Studies III: Mystical Ultimate Realities

Collaborative exploration and critical analysis of comparative studies of mystical ultimate realities. Participants will select from the several samples included in the reader. Students’ presentations.

- Readings:**
- Abe, Masao, “Kenosis and Emptiness.”
 - Arapura, J. G., “Transcendent Brahman or Transcendent Void: Which is Ultimately Real?”
 - Coward, Harold, “*Prakrti* and the Collective Unconscious: *Purusa* and Self.”
 - Zaehner, Robert C., “God and Brahman.”
 - von Brück, Michael, “Buddhist Shunyata and the Christian Trinity: The Emerging Holistic Paradigm.”

December 8. Conclusion

Full circle: What is mysticism? Students’ presentations. Closing ritual.

 **FINAL PAPER DUE!**

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

Course Reader Contents

1. Bouyer, L. (1980). *Mysticism: An essay of the history of the word*. In R. Woods (Ed), Understanding Mysticism (pp. 42-55). Garden City, NY: Doubleday.
2. King, R. (1999). The power of definitions: A genealogy of the idea of 'the mystical.' In Orientalism and religion: Postcolonial theory, India, and 'the mystic East.' (pp. 7-34). New York: Routledge.
3. Happold, F. C. (1970). What we shall understand by mysticism. The mysticism of love and union and the mysticism of knowledge and understanding. Nature-mysticism, soul-mysticism, and God-mysticism. In Mysticism: A study and anthology (pp. 35-45). New York: Penguin.
4. Arico, C. (1999). The *Lectio Divina* tradition: Lost and found. In A taste of silence (pp. 103-122). New York: Continuum.
5. Ellwood, R. S. (1999). A history of mysticism. In Mysticism and religion (pp. 54-76). (2nd ed.). New York: Seven Bridges Press.
6. Hollenback, J. B. (1996). The mystical experience: A preliminary reconnaissance. In Mysticism: Experience, response, and empowerment (pp. 33-39). University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press.
7. Dupré, L. (1996). *Unio mystica*: The state and the experience. In M. Idel & B. McGinn (Eds.), Mystical union in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam: An ecumenical dialogue (pp. 3-23). New York: Continuum.
8. Barnard, G. W. (1994). Transformations and transformers: Spirituality and the academic study of mysticism. Journal of Consciousness Studies, 1(2), 256-60.
9. Paden, W. E. (1992). Comparative perspective in the study of religion. In Interpreting the sacred: Ways of viewing religion (pp. 67-86). Boston: Beacon Press.
10. McGinn, B. (1994). Comparativist and psychological approaches to mysticism. In The foundations of mysticism (pp. 326-43). New York: Crossroad.
11. Parsons, William B. (2000). Themes and debates in the psychology-comparativist dialogue. In D. Jonte-Pace and W. B. Parsons (Eds.), Religion and psychology: Mapping the terrain (pp. 229-53). New York: Routledge.
12. Patton, K. C. & Ray, B. C. (2000). Introduction. In K. C. Patton & B. C. Ray (Eds.), A magic still dwells: Comparative religion in the postmodern age (pp. 1-19). Berkeley: University of California Press.
13. Rao, S. (1996). Comparative metaphysics: Means or end? In N. Smart & B. S. Murthy (Eds.), East-West encounters in philosophy and religion (pp. 292-299). Long Beach, CA: Long Beach Publications.
14. Sheldrake, P. (1992). Interpreting spiritual texts. In Spirituality and history: Questions of interpretation and method (pp. 163-87). New York: Crossroad.
15. Staal, F. (1975). Effort, doubt, and criticism. In Exploring mysticism (pp. 123-134). Berkeley: University of California Press.
16. Cousins, E. H. (1992). Methodology for mysticism. In Christ of the 21st century (pp. 120-123). Rockport, MA: Element.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

17. Holdrege, B. A. (2000). What's beyond the post? Comparative analysis as critical method. In K. C. Patton & B. C. Ray (Eds.), A magic still dwells: Comparative religion in the postmodern age (pp. 77-91). Berkeley: University of California Press.
18. Neville, R. C. & Wildman, W. J. (2001). On comparing religious ideas. In R. C. Neville (Ed.), The human condition. A volume in the Comparative Religious Ideas Project (pp. 9-20). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
19. Kripal, J. J. (2001). Roads of excess. Palaces of wisdom. In Roads of excess, palaces of wisdom: Eroticism and reflexivity in the study of mysticism (pp. 1-15, 25-31, 305-30). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
20. Clarke, J. J. (1994). Orientalism. Criticisms and shortcomings. In Jung and Eastern thought: A dialogue with the Orient (pp. 14-27, 36, 158-178). New York: Routledge.
21. Jones, R. H. (1993). Concerning Carl Jung on Asian religious traditions. In Mysticism examined (pp. 169-183). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
22. Borella, J. (1995). René Guénon and the traditionalist school. In A. Faivre & J. Needleman (Eds.), Modern esoteric spirituality (pp. 330-58). New York: Crossroads.
23. Quinn, W. W. (1997). Hermeneutics of the tradition. In The only tradition (pp. 19-29). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
24. Smith, H. (1984). Introduction. In F. Schuon, The transcendent unity of religions (pp. ix-xxvii). Wheaton, IL: Quest.
25. Nasr, S. H. (1993). The *philosophia perennis* and the study of religion. In The need for a sacred science (pp. 53-68). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
26. King, S. B. (2001). The *philosophia perennis* and the religions of the world. In L. E. Hahn, R. E. Auxier & W. Stone (Eds.), The philosophy of Seyyed Hassein Nasr (pp. 203-20). The Library of Living Philosophers, Vol. XXVIII. Chicago: Open Court.
27. Katz, S. T. (1978). Language, epistemology, and mysticism. In S. T. Katz (ed.), Mysticism and philosophical analysis (pp. 22-74). Oxford, NY: Oxford University Press.
28. Gimello, R. M. (1983). Mysticism in its contexts. In S. T. Katz (Ed.), Mysticism and religious traditions (pp. 61-88). New York: Oxford University Press.
29. Raphael, M. (1994). Feminism, constructivism and numinous experience. Religious Studies 30, 511-26.
30. Jantzen, G. M. (1995). Conclusion: Mysticism and modernity. In Power, gender and Christian mysticism (322-53). New York: Cambridge University Press.
31. Evans, D. (1989). Can philosophers limit what mystics can do? A critique of Steven Katz. Religious Studies, 25, 53-60.
32. Forman, R. K. C. (1998). Introduction: Mystical consciousness, the innate capacity, and the perennial psychology. In R. K. C. Forman (Ed.), The innate capacity: Mysticism, psychology, and philosophy (pp. 3-41). New York: Oxford University Press.
33. Fenton, J. Y. (1995). Mystical experience as a bridge for cross-cultural philosophy of religion: A critique. In T. Dean (ed.), Religious pluralism and truth: Essays on cross-cultural philosophy of religion (pp. 189-204). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
34. Wilber, K. (1997). The spectrum of consciousness: Integral psychology and the perennial philosophy. In a modern light: Integral anthropology and the evolution of cultures. In The eye of Spirit: An integral vision for a world gone slightly mad (pp. 37-50, 58-67). Boston, MA: Shambhala.
35. Wilber, K. (1995). The reconstruction of the contemplative path. In Sex, ecology, spirituality: The spirit of evolution (pp. 276-278). Boston, MA: Shambhala.
36. Cupitt, D. (1998). Introduction: The mysticism of secondariness. In Mysticism after modernity (pp. 1-11). Malden, MA: Blackwell.
37. Herman, J. (2000). The contextual illusion: Comparative mysticism and postmodernism. In K. C. Patton & B. C. Ray (Eds.), A magic still dwells: Comparative religion in the postmodern age (pp. 92-100). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

38. Stoeber, M. (1994). Constructivist epistemologies of mysticism: A critique and a revision. In Theo-monistic mysticism: A Hindu-Christian comparison (pp. 7-38). New York: St. Martin's Press.
39. Hollenback, J. B. (1996). The contextuality of the most elevated states of spiritual perfection and mystical awareness. In Mysticism: Experience, response, and empowerment (pp. 580-615). University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press.
40. Vroom, H. M. (1989). Exclusivity and universality: Interreligious relations. In Religions and the truth (pp. 376-388). Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company.
41. Heim, S. M. (1995). Salvations: A more pluralistic hypothesis. In Salvations: Truth and difference in religion (pp. 129-157). New York: Orbis.
42. Kaplan, S. (2002). An overview of the problem and the proposal. The issue of soteriological exclusivity. In Different paths, different summits: A model for religious pluralism (pp. 1-27, 169-70). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
43. Clarke, J. J. (1997). Religious dialogue. In Oriental enlightenment: The encounter between Asian and Western thought (pp. 130-148). New York: Routledge.
44. Wiggins, J. B. (1996). Whither Inter-religious interchange? In In praise of religious diversity (pp. 89-108). New York: Routledge.
45. Ray, R. (1987). Background: Contemplative dialogue at Naropa Institute. In S. Walker (Ed.), Speaking of silence: Christians and Buddhists on the contemplative way (pp. 11-18). New York: Paulist Press.
46. Teasdale, W. (1999). What is inter-spirituality? Opening the heart of the world: Toward a universal mysticism. In The mystic heart: Discovering a universal spirituality among the world's religions (pp. 26-28, 235-50). Novato, CA: New World Library.
47. Zaehner, R. C. (1980). Mysticism sacred and profane. In R. Woods (Ed), Understanding mysticism (56-77). Garden City, NY: Doubleday.
48. Smith, H. (2000). Do drugs have religious import? In Cleansing the doors of perception (pp. 15-32). New York: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Putnam.
49. Grof, S. (1988). A taxonomy of transpersonal experiences. In The adventure of self-discovery (pp. 134-38, 140-48). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
50. Merkur, D. (1998). The unitive phenomena. In The ecstatic imagination: Psychedelic experiences and the psychoanalysis of self-actualization (pp. 91-99). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
51. Parrinder, G. (1982). Theophany: Differences between Krishna and Christ. In Avatar and incarnation: A comparison of Indian and Christian beliefs (pp. 223-239). New York: Oxford University Press.
52. Suzuki, D. T. (1962). Crucifixion and enlightenment. In Mysticism: Christian and Buddhist. The Eastern and Western way (pp. 98-105). New York: Collier Books.
53. Carpenter, D. (1995). Bhartrhari and Bonaventure in comparison. In Revelation, history, and the dialogue of religions: A study of Bhartrhari and Bonaventure (pp. 137-175). New York: Orbis.
54. Chatterji, P. (1982). Plotinus and Sri Aurobindo: A comparative study. In R. Baine Harris (Ed.), Neoplatonism and Indian thought (pp. 257-72). Norfolk, VI: International Society For Neoplatonic Studies.
55. Wong, Joseph H. (2001). Through detachment of vision: Chuang Tzu and Meister Eckhart. In B. Barnhart & J. Wong (Eds.), Purity of the heart and contemplation: A monastic dialogue between Christian and Asian traditions (pp. 210-26). New York: Continuum.
56. Loy, D. (1988). Three approaches to the subject-object relation. In Nonduality: A study in comparative philosophy (pp. 180-201). New Jersey: Humanities Press.
57. Sundarajan, K. R. (1996). Experiencing the world: A comparative study of Lila and Satori. In N. Smart & B. S. Murthy (Eds.), East-West encounters in philosophy and religion (pp. 105-119). Long Beach, CA: Long Beach Publications.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

58. Jennings, W. H. (1996). *Agape and karuna: Some comparisons*. Journal of Contemporary Religion, 11(2), 209-217.
59. Elder, G. R. (1985). "Grace" in Martin Luther and Tantric Buddhism. In G. H. Houston (Ed.), The cross and the lotus: Christianity and Buddhism in dialogue (pp. 25-49). Delhi, India: Motilal Banarsidass.
60. Hacker, P. (1995). Cit and Nous, or the concept of Spirit in Vedantism and Neoplatonism. In W. Halbfass (Ed.), Philology and confrontation: Paul Hacker on traditional and modern Vedanta (pp. 211-26). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
61. Abe, M. (1990). Kenosis and emptiness. In R. Corless & P. F. Knitter (Eds.), Buddhist emptiness and Christian trinity: Essays and explorations (pp. 5-25). New York: Paulist Press.
62. Arapura, J. G. (1981). Transcendent Brahman or transcendent void: Which is ultimately real? In A. M. Olson & L. S. Rouner (Eds.), Transcendence and the sacred (pp. 83-99). Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
63. Coward, H. (1985). Prakrti and the collective unconscious: Purusa and Self. In Jung and Eastern thought (pp. 145-168). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
64. Zaehner, R. C. (1960/1994). God and Brahman. In Hindu and Muslim Mysticism (pp. 41-63). Oxford: Oneworld.
65. von Brück, M. (1990). Buddhist shunyata and the Christian Trinity: The emerging holistic paradigm. In R. Corless & P. F. Knitter (Eds.), Buddhist emptiness and Christian trinity: Essays and explorations (pp. 44-66). New York: Paulist Press.

Research Bibliography:

1. Universalist/Perennialists Approaches

- Bucke, R. M. (1961). *Cosmic Consciousness: A Study in the evolution of the Human Mind*. Secaucus, N J: Citadel Press.
- Burckhardt, T. (1987). *Mirror of the Intellect*. (Trans. William Stoddart). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Cutsinger, J. S. (1997). *Advice to the Serious Seeker: Meditations on the Teaching of Frithjof Schuon*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Hick, J. (1992). *An Interpretation of Religion: Human Responses to the Transcendent*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Huxley, A. (1945). *The Perennial Philosophy*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Ingram, P. O. (1997). *Wrestling with the Ox: A Theology of Religious Experience*. New York: Continuum.
- James, W. (1902) *Varieties of Religious Experience*. New York: Modern Library.
- Loy, D. (1988). *Nonduality: A Study in Comparative Philosophy*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Merrell-Wolff, F. (1973). *The Philosophy of Consciousness Without an Object*. New York: Julian Press.
- Merrell-Wolff, F. (1995). *Transformations in Consciousness: The Metaphysics & Epistemology*. Albany, SUNY Press.
- Nasr, S. H. (Ed.). (1986). *The Essential Writings of Frithjof Schuon*. Rockport, MA: Element.
- Nasr, S. H. (1989). *Knowledge and the Sacred*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Nasr, S. H. (1993). *The Need for a Sacred Science*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (especially ch. 3-4)
- Needleman, J. (Ed.). (1986). *The Sword of Gnosis: Metaphysics, Cosmology, Tradition, Symbolism*. London: Arkana.
- Otto, R. (1958). *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and its Relation to the Rational*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Perry, W. N. (Ed.). (1981). *A Treasury of Traditional Wisdom*. London: Perennial Books.
- Quinn, W. W. (1997). *The Only Tradition*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Schumacher, E. F. (1977). *A Guide for the Perplexed*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Schuon, F. (1984). *The Transcendent Unity of Religions*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (And any other book by Schuon, specially *The Eye of the Heart; Logic & Transcendence*, and *Gnosis -- Divine Wisdom*)
- Sharma, A. (Ed.). (1991). *Fragments of Infinity*. Garden City Park, NY: Prism Press.
- Smith, H. (1976). *Forgotten Truth*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Smith, H. (1989). *Beyond the Postmodern Mind*. (Updated and revised). Wheaton, IL: The Theosophical Publishing House.
- Stace, W. T. (1986/1960). *Mysticism and Philosophy*. Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher.
- Teasdale, W. (1999). *The Mystic Heart: Discovering a Universal Spirituality Among the World's Religions*. Novato, CA: New World Library.
- Underhill, E. (1910/1961). *Mysticism: A Study in the Nature of Man's Spiritual Consciousness*. New York: Dutton.
- Wilber, K. (1977). *The Spectrum of Consciousness*. Ithaca, IL: Quest.
- Wilber, K. (1995). *Sex, Ecology, Spirituality: The Spirit of Evolution*. Boston, MA: Shambhala.
- Wilber, K. (1997). *The Eye of Spirit*. Boston, MA: Shambhala.

2. Contextualist/Pluralist Approaches

- Angel, L. (1994). *Enlightenment East and West*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (C)
- Dean, T. (Ed.). (1995). *Religious Pluralism and Truth: Essays on Cross-Cultural Philosophy of Religion*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Gill, J. H. (1989). *Mediated Transcendence: A Postmodern Reflection*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press.
- Gimello, R. M. (1978). *Mysticism and Meditation*. In S. Katz (Ed.), *Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis*, 170-199. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Heim, S. M. (1995). *Salvations: Truth and Difference in Religion*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books.
- Hollenback, J. B. (1996). *Mysticism: Experience, Response, & Empowerment*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Idel, M. & McGinn, B. (Eds.). (1996). *Mystical Union in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam: An Ecumenical Dialogue*. New York: Continuum.
- Irwin, L. (1996). *Visionary Worlds: The Making and Unmaking of Reality*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Jantzen, G. M. (1995). *Power, Gender and Christian mysticism*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Jones, R. (1909). *Studies in Mystical Religion*. New York: Macmillan.
- Kaplan, S. (2002). *Different Paths, Different Summits: A Model for Religious Pluralism*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Katz, S. T. (Ed.). (1978a). *Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Katz, S. T. (1978b). Language, Epistemology, and Mysticism. In S. T. Katz (Ed.), *Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis*, 22-74. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Katz, S. T. (Ed.). (1983). *Mysticism and Religious Traditions*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Katz, S. T. (1992). *Mysticism and Language*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Klein, A. (1986). *Knowledge and Liberation: Tibetan Buddhist Epistemology in Support of Transformative Religious Experience*. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications.
- Neville, R. C. (Ed.). (2001). *Ultimate Realities. A Volume in the Comparative Religious Ideas Project*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Paden, W. F. (1988). *Religious Worlds*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.
- Paden, W. E. (1992). *Interpreting the Sacred: Ways of Viewing Religion*. Boston, MA: Bacon Press.
- Prabhu, J. (Ed.). (1996). *The Intercultural Challenge of Raimon Panikkar*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books. (And any other book by Panikkar)
- Proudfoot, W. (1985). *Religious Experience*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Scholem, G. (1941). *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*. (3rd edition). New York: Schocken Books.
- Vroom, H. M. (1989). *Religions and the Truth: Philosophical Reflections and Perspectives*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company.

3. On the Perennialist/Contextualist Debate

P = Perennialist emphasis
 C = Contextualist emphasis

- Adam, M. T. (2002). A Post-Kantian Perspective on Recent Debates about Mystical Experience. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 70(4), 801-17. (P)
- Almond, P. (1982). *Mystical Experience and Religious Doctrine: An Investigation of the Study of Mysticism in World Religions*. New York: Mouton. (C)
- Bagger, M. (1991). Ecumenicalism and Perennialism Revisited. *Religious Studies*, 27, 399-411. (C)
- Brainard, S. (1996). Defining "Mystical Experience." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 64(2), 359-393. (Neutral)
- Byrne, P. (1984). Mysticism, Identity and Realism: A Debate Reviewed. *International Journal of Philosophy of Religion*, 16, 237-244. (P)
- Dean, T. (1984). Primordial Tradition or Postmodern Hermeneutics? A Review Essay of A. M. Olson & L. S. Rouner (Eds.), *Transcendence & the Sacred* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1981), and S. H. Nasr, *Knowledge and the Sacred, The Gifford Lectures 1981* (New York: Crossroad, 1981). *Philosophy East & West*, 34(2), 211-226. (C)

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Evans, D. (1989). Can Philosophers Limit What Mystics Can Do? A Critique of Steven Katz. *Religious Studies*, 25, 53-60. (P)
- Fenton, J. Y. (1995). Mystical Experience as a Bridge for Cross-Cultural Philosophy of Religion. In T. Dean (Ed.), *Religious Pluralism and Truth: Essays on Cross-cultural Philosophy of Religion*, 189-204. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (C)
- Forgie, J. W. (1985). Mystical Experience and the Argument from Agreement. *International Journal for Philosophy & Religion*, 17(3), 97-113. (C)
- Forman, R. K. C. (1989). Paramartha and Modern Constructivists on Mysticism: Epistemological Monomorphism versus Duomorphism. *Philosophy East & West*, 39(4), 391-418. (P)
- Forman, R. K. C. (Ed.). (1990). *The Problem of Pure Consciousness: Mysticism and Philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. (P)
- Forman, R. K. C. (Ed.). (1998). *The Innate Capacity: Mysticism, Psychology, and Philosophy*. New York: Oxford University Press. (P)
- Forman, R. K. C. (1999). *Mysticism, Mind, Consciousness*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (P)
- Gill, J. H. (1984). Mysticism and Mediation. *Faith and Philosophy*, Jan (1), 111-121. (C)
- Griffin, D. R. & Smith, H. (Eds.). (1989). *Primordial Truth and Postmodern Theology*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (P/C)
- Griffiths, P. J. (1991). *An Apology for Apologetics: A Study in the Logic of Interreligious Dialogue*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis. (especially ch. 3) (C)
- Horne, J. R. (1974). Which Mystic Has the Revelation? *Religious Studies*, 2, 283-291. (C)
- Jantzen, G. M. (1994). Feminists, Philosophers, & Mystics. *Hypatia*, 9(4), 186-206. (C)
- Jones, R. H. (1994). Experience and Conceptualization in Mystical Knowledge. In R. H. Jones, *Mysticism Examined: Philosophical Inquires into Mysticism*, 19-46. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. (C)
- Katz, S. T. (1985). Recent Work on Mysticism. *History of Religions*, 25, 76-86. (C)
- Katz, S. T. (1988). On Mysticism. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 56(4), 751-757. (C)
- King, S. B. (1988). Two Epistemological Models for the Interpretation of Mysticism. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 56(2), 257-279. (P)
- King, S. B. (1988). On Mysticism. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 56(4), 759-761. (P)
- McGinn, B. (1992). *The Foundations of Mysticism. Vol. I. of The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mysticism*. New York: Crossroad. (see especially his Appendix: Theoretical Foundations: The Modern Study of Mysticism, pp.264-343). (C)
- McDermott, R. A. (1989). From Mysticism to a Modern Spiritual Cognition. *Revision*, 12(1), 29-33. (C)
- Nasr, S. H. (1985). Response to Thomas Dean's Review of *Knowledge and the Sacred*. *Philosophy East & West*, 35(1), 87-90. (P)
- Olson, A. M. (1985). On Primordialism versus Post-Modernism: A Response to Thomas Dean. *Philosophy East & West*, 35(1), 91-95. (P)
- Perovich, A. N. Jr. (1985a). Mysticism and the Philosophy of Science. *The Journal of Religion*, 65, 63-82. (P)

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.

- Perovich, A. N. Jr. (1985b). Mysticism or Mediation: A Response to Gill. *Faith and Philosophy*, April (2), 179-188. (P)
- Pike, N. (1992). *Mystic Union. An Essay in the Phenomenology of Mysticism*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. (see especially the Supplementary Study 2: Steven Katz on Christian Mysticism, pp. 194-207) (P)
- Price, J. R., III. (1985). The Objectivity of Mystical Truth Claims. *The Thomist*, 49(1), 81-98. (P)
- Raphael, M. (1994). Feminism, Constructivism and Numinous Experience. *Religious Studies*, 30, 511-526. (C)
- Rothberg, D. (1989). Understanding Mysticism: Transpersonal Theory and the Limits of Contemporary Epistemological Frameworks. *Revision*, 12(2), 5-21. (P)
- Shear, J. (1990). *The Inner Dimension: Philosophy & the Experience of Consciousness*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing. (P)
- Shear, J. (1994). On Mystical Experiences as Support for the Perennial Philosophy. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 62(2), 319-342. (P)
- Short, L. (1996). Mysticism, Mediation, and the Non-Linguistic. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 63(4), 659-675. (Neutral)
- Smith, H. (1987). Is there a Perennial Philosophy? *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 55, 553-566. (P)
- Smith, H. (1988). On Mysticism. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 56(4), 757-759. (P)
- Stoeber, M. (1992). Constructivist Epistemologies of Mysticism: A Critique and a Revision. *Religious Studies*, 28(1), 107-116. (P)
- Wainwright, W. J. (1981). *Mysticism: A Study of its Nature, Cognitive Value and Moral Implications*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press. (P)
- Woods, R. (Ed.). (1980). *Understanding Mysticism*. Garden City, New York: Image Books. (P/C)

Instructor:

Jorge N. Ferrer, Ph.D. is core faculty at the California Institute of Integral Studies and adjunct faculty at the Institute of Transpersonal Psychology. Jorge is the author of *Revisioning Transpersonal Theory: A Participatory Vision of Human Spirituality* (SUNY Press 2002) and editor of a *ReVision* monograph on “New Horizons in Contemporary Spirituality.” His writings have appeared in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, *World Futures: The Journal of General Evolution*, *ReVision*, *The Scientific and Medical Network Review*, *The International Journal of Transpersonal Studies*, *The Salamander Review*, and *Tikkun*, among other publications. In 2000 he received the Fetzer Institute’s Presidential Award for his seminal work on consciousness studies.

Note: Permissions to use this material must be obtained directly from the author.